



LJMU Research Online

Chipangura, N and Silika, KK

Contested archaeological approaches to mass grave exhumations in Zimbabwe

<http://researchonline.ljmu.ac.uk/id/eprint/15676/>

Article

Citation (please note it is advisable to refer to the publisher's version if you intend to cite from this work)

Chipangura, N and Silika, KK (2020) Contested archaeological approaches to mass grave exhumations in Zimbabwe. Journal of Conflict Archaeology, 14 (2-3). pp. 163-180. ISSN 1574-0773

LJMU has developed **LJMU Research Online** for users to access the research output of the University more effectively. Copyright © and Moral Rights for the papers on this site are retained by the individual authors and/or other copyright owners. Users may download and/or print one copy of any article(s) in LJMU Research Online to facilitate their private study or for non-commercial research. You may not engage in further distribution of the material or use it for any profit-making activities or any commercial gain.

The version presented here may differ from the published version or from the version of the record. Please see the repository URL above for details on accessing the published version and note that access may require a subscription.

For more information please contact researchonline@ljmu.ac.uk

<http://researchonline.ljmu.ac.uk/>

Contested archaeological approaches to mass grave exhumations in Zimbabwe.

Abstract

Within the last 50 years, present day Zimbabwe, formerly Rhodesia, a Southern African country, has gone through various pogroms resulting in the death of over 50, 000 people in total both within and outside the country. The massacres consist of the liberation war (1966-1979), political violence characterised by every election since 1980-, the Matabeleland democide (1982-1987), and the diamond conflict in Marange, Eastern Zimbabwe (2006- 2018). These various episodes of violence have produced a myriad of human body depositional sites which include mine shafts, mass graves at schools and hospitals, burials at detention centres, pit latrines, and caves. This paper will analyse the contestations, and attrition between professional archaeologists, and vernacular exhumers that emerged during various limited exhumation of mass graves within the country. The paper will conclude by offering avenues of contemporary approaches to mass graves exhumation as the material evidence might in future subject to judicial inquiries, contribute towards truth telling and peace and reconciliation.

Key words: *Exhumation, politics, forensic archaeology, mass graves, and material evidence.*

Background to the conflicts

Liberation War

Present day Zimbabwe was part of the Federation of Southern Rhodesia which consisted of Northern Rhodesia (Zambia), the protectorate of Nyasaland (Malawi) and Southern Rhodesia (Zimbabwe) (Bhebhe and Ranger, 1996; Evans, 2007). This federation broke up when both Zambia and Malawi

achieved their independence from Great Britain in 1964 and the Ian Smith led government declared a Unilateral Declaration of Independence (UDI) on the 11th of November 1965. The declaration polarised the Smith regime with the rest of the country and triggered the birth of Black Nationalist organisations which sought to seek dialogue over land, discriminatory laws, and racism. The first such party was the African National Congress (ANC) formed in 1957 and Joshua Nkomo, was its first leader (Nkomo, 1984). This party was soon banned in 1959 as the Rhodesian government felt that its leaders were inciting the black majority workers and youth in townships to revolt against white minority rule. Soon after that, The Zimbabwe African Peoples Union (ZAPU) led by Joshua Nkomo was formed in December 1961. This soon split in 1963 when Rev Ndabaningi Sithole formed Zimbabwe African National Union (ZANU) - known later as the Patriotic Front, ZANU-PF (Martin and Johnson, 1981; Nkomo, 1984). The split was due to tribal nuances, the quest for power, mistrust, and strategic armed struggle reasons (Doran, 2017; Sithole, 1999). Due to the failure of the political process, the banning of indigenous political parties, discriminatory laws, the armed struggle, also known as second *Chimurenga* by the parties started in earnest in 1966 (Bhebhe and Ranger, 1995). The word *Chimurenga* was taken from the spiritual icon Murenga, who served as an elder and cultural priest during the precolonial era and the first uprising against colonial rule in 1895 (Ranger, 1967).

The two respective political parties soon developed associated armed wings with ZANU aligned to the Zimbabwe African National Liberation Army (ZANLA) and ZAPU having the Zimbabwe People's Revolutionary Army (ZIPRA). The two main guerrilla groups, ZANLA and ZIPRA, had slightly different approaches to training, recruitment, and war strategies (Bhebhe and Ranger, 1995; Martin and Johnson, 1981). ZIPRA had a conventional military structure with intelligence, artillery, air units and recruiting mostly from western parts of the country (Dabengwa, 1995; Sibanda, 2005). ZANLA recruited from different parts of the country particularly eastern areas had Chinese backing, preferred a guerrilla style of war, and Maoist approach of winning hearts and minds (Mhanda, 2011; Mutambara, 2012). In terms of the ethnic make-up, these guerrilla groups both camps had mixed speakers of both local dominant languages (*Shona* and *Ndebele*, the former being spoken by over 80% of the population) but over time ZAPU/ZIPRA was associated with Ndebele speakers and Shona with ZANU/ZANLA

(Dabengwa, 1995; Evans, 2007). These subtle linguistic differences were vital in that they shaped the killings that later occurred in the 1980s. The liberation war was fought by these two armed militant groups for 15 years and over 30,000 people lost their lives not only in Zimbabwe but also in neighbouring countries such as Mozambique and Zambia (Alexander and McGregor, 2000; Moorcroft and McLaughlin, 2016). The remains from the liberation war are scattered around contested sites in the country which includes mine shafts and mass graves at former detention centres such as Butchers Site and Hebert Mine in Eastern Zimbabwe which will be discussed further in this paper.

The Matabeleland Democide.

Soon after independence from Great Britain, the new government under Robert Mugabe was faced with the complex task of integrating three armed groups into a single national army under the supervision of the British. This was the Rhodesian Army, ZIPRA and ZANLA. This operation was not particularly successful due to nepotism, quest of power by ZANU-PF, and tribalism (Evans, 1991; Nkomo, 1984). This led to skirmishes between former ZANLA and ZIPRA cadres at assembly points and disorientation of men from both camps in Entubane, Connemara, Ntabazinduna and Chitungwiza (Alexander and MacGregor, 2000; CCJP, 1997). As a result of these disorientations, a 'dissident narrative' soon emerged. This was purposely used to describe ZIPRA cadres who had escaped assembly points and went on to commit crimes in the Matabeleland provinces (Alexander, 1998; Kriger, 2003). There were also former ZANLA cadres committing similar offences in the Mashonaland provinces but they were not labelled as such (Alao, 1994). Mugabe, who had won elections and sworn in as Prime minister, also had designs for a one party state which was resisted both within and outside his own party to his own frustration (Doran, 2017; Shaw, 1986). There was also the 'discovery' of arms caches in Matabeleland which the state attributed to evidence of dissidents within ZAPU, this was not exactly truthful as both ZANLA and ZIPRA cadres had cached arms and it was widely known (CCJP, 1997; Doran, 2017). The caches was used as an excuse to further tarnish the image of ZAPU as a 'dissident party' and to justify the events that unfolded afterwards. In addition to this scenario, South Africa had a destabilisation policy for Zimbabwe under Operation Drama (Doran, 2017; Obrien, 2011). This was a counter insurgency

program to destabilise Zimbabwe by training and arming spies and former 'dissidents' to make incursions in to Zimbabwe and commit offences (Scarnecchia, 2001; Phimister, 2008).

Mugabe at independence assumed the dual role of minister of defence and Prime Minister hence he was able to negotiate with the North Korean leader, Kim Il Sung in Pyongyang in 1981 for the training of an army unit that would report directly to him (CCJP, 1997). Mugabe commissioned this brigade, which he named the 5th Brigade or *Gukurahundi* (Ibid). *Gukurahundi* meaning the early rain that washes away the chaff before spring (Werbner, 1991). The Brigade comprised over 3500 men, which consist of mostly Shona speaking ex ZANLA cadres. This brigade, was headed by the present Minister of Agriculture and former Air Marshall, Perence Shiri, and was trained for over a year at a secret location in Nyanga and deployed in Matabeleland North in January 1983.

The 5th Brigade started its training in September 1982 and Mugabe handed them a flag embroidered with the word *Gukurahundi* and told the passing out brigade to go and plough and reconstruct Matabeleland (Cameroon, 2018; Werbner, 1991). The 5th brigade then began a systematic campaign of murder, torture, rape and arbitrary detention of ZAPU and ZIPRA members who were overwhelmingly Ndebele. The stand out massacre was the murder of 67 young people on River Cewale, of which 6 survived by pretending to be dead (CCJP, 1997). Witness testimony at hand and collected that time also revealed extreme methods of torture and murder which included forcing victims into huts and setting them alight, making victims dig their own shallow graves and shooting them within, being buried alive, and thrown down pit latrines and mineshafts (Silika, 2019). When international news broke of the atrocities and the CCJP made a report which they presented to Mugabe, the 5th brigade was briefly withdrawn, retrained and redeployed in Matabeleland South in 1984 (CCJP, 1997). In this province, tactics changed to more subtle methods however kidnapping, torture, starvation, curfews, rape and bayoneting of pregnant women continued (CCJP, 1997). The most notorious detention centre to be opened during that time was the Bhalagwe Camp, near Antelope mine. In the first few months of the operation of Bhalagwe Camp, over 2,000 people were detained, tortured, and their remains thrown into nearby Antelope mine (Berkeley and Schrage, 1986). The exact number of killed at this site is unknown however the camp was abandoned and not been used for any other reason and some of the buildings have been destroyed.

There has been sporadic recovery of remains at the site however people are fearful of approaching due to security, spiritual and political contexts. This period of unrest ended with the signing of a Unity Agreement between ZAPU and ZANU in 1987 and left between 20-30 000 people killed, although some estimates put the deaths even higher of 50 000 (CCJP, 1997; Coltart, 2017; Cross, 2016). The remains of Gukurahundi democides are found in mass graves near schools and hospitals, caves, former pit latrines, burnt huts and mine shafts (EAAF, 1999; 2001).

Political Violence and the Disappeared.

Since 1980, Zimbabwe has held 8 presidential elections, 8 parliamentary elections and 2 constitutional referendums all of which have been marred by political violence with opposition members bearing the brunt of the violence (Reeler, 2009; Sachikonye, 2011). When Zimbabwe achieved its independence in 1980, the Mugabe regime inherited most of the apparatus that were responsible for human rights abuses during the previous two decades particularly the dreaded Central Intelligence Organisation (CIO) (Courville, 2012; Flower, 1987). The emergence of viable opposition in the form of the Movement of Democratic Change (MDC) in 1999 seemed to have increased the ruling party ZANU-PF appetite for violence. This also been aided by the availability of former ZANLA and ZIPRA personnel in its ranks. . In addition, the government has had at its disposal former war veterans and government trained militia (these were trained ostensibly to conduct ‘youth service’ however they have been used by ZANU-PF for campaign purposes (Chidza, 2015). Except for 2013, every election year is marked by groups associated with government setting up ‘bases’ particularly in rural areas where opposition party members are arbitrarily kidnapped and some instances killed (Chitukutuku, 2017). The elections of 2000, 2002, 2008 have been the most violent particularly the later which resulted in the MDC presidential candidate, Morgan Tsvangirayi, withdrawing from the election. In August 2018 and January 2019 for instance, over 20 people were killed by the Zimbabwe National Army (ZNA) personnel, Police, and CIO in various locations such as Harare, Bulawayo, Kadoma, and Epworth (Zimbabwe Human Rights Forum, 2019). A commission of inquiry for the August 2018 killings, the Motlanthe Commission, blamed the opposition for the post-election riots but noted the army were responsible for the killings (Motlanthe, 2018). Due to the partisan nature of the police service, and

judiciary most of the offences are never comprehensively investigated and a presidential amnesty has followed each and every period of violence (Magaisa, 2016). Opposition member's estimates that over 5000 people have been killed since year 2000, millions displaced and a sizeable number missing (Aids Free World, 2009; Cross, 2016; HRW, 2009).

Blood Diamonds.

The discovery of surface diamonds in Chiadzwa, Marange around 2006 triggered a massive invasion of the area by 'illegal panners' also known, in local parlance, as *makorokoza/magweja*. The alluvial diamond fields are in the municipal ward of Chiadzwa, about 80 miles southwest of the city of Mutare in the Manicaland Province. Between 2006 and 2007, 'illegal diamond mining' in the area continued unabated with the local community also joining the enterprise (Chipangura and Marufu, 2019). On the realisation of the scale of illegal panning, the government then deployed the ZNA, police and CIO operatives into the area.

. When alluvial diamonds were discovered in the area the government through ZANU-PF senior figures encouraged illegal mining syndicates to operate amidst a major economic crisis within the country which had brought about hyperinflation and high unemployment levels (Cross, 2015; HRW, 2009) . The diamond rush was thus the direct result of an open government policy, later overturned after chaos erupted as thousands of miners descended on the mining field. In November 2008, the mining door was shut by the government, which had initially permitted illegal miners to exploit the diamonds soon after their discovery. (Chipangura, 2017). With a collapsing economy that had triggered massive unemployment (90% unemployment rate), mostly among the youths, the ruling government was presented with an opportunity in Chiadzwa to appease the restless population by allowing free exploitation of the recently discovered diamond fields. Thus, allowing *makorokozas* (illegal miners) to freely mine was a way of trying to garner votes for the upcoming presidential and general elections. However, after its re-election in July 2008 the government decided to violently drive *makorokozas* out of the area under the pretext of restoration of order. A violent military operation code named 'Operation *Hakudzokwi*' was launched in November 2018 which resulted in an estimated death of 300 illegal miners (CNRG, 2009).

At the peak of the diamond rush, senior securiocrats in army, police intelligence joined hands with the illegal panners to form syndicates in which they would share proceeds from illegal diamond sales in return for offering the miners protection (Saunders and Nyamuda, 2016; Simpson, 2018). Certain sections of the fields were known by monikers of connected individuals who owned them. For instance, the Vice President at that time, Dr Joyce Mujuru and her deceased retired army general husband, Solomon Mujuru, had place called ‘*Churu chekwaMujuru*’ -hill that belongs to the Mujuru’s. Her daughter, Nyasha Del Campo, was caught trying to sell Kimberly Process uncertified diamonds worth US\$15 million with her Portuguese husband to European clients in 2009 (Rukuni, 2009). At the height of the diamond rush, over 35.000 people made it to the fields spurning an informal sector surrounding the areas (AIDC, 2016). Internationally connected diamonds dealers such as the notorious Sam Pa also started to come into the area who had links to senior government figures who facilitated the movement of the diamonds and money on an international scale (Burgis, 2015).

In order to evade police seizure of diamonds and local criminal gangs, panners soon developed technics to elude confiscation of their precious finds. One way was to swallow some pellets and excrete them when they go past check points and another wide was to hide in all possible orifices (Witness Testimony, 2017). Soldiers soon picked up on this modus operandi which resulted in some panners being detained for days so they can pass them out. Those who tried to escape were shot. Women who were in the fields who were caught would often be tortured, raped and some infected with HIV as a result (AIDC, 2016). The precise number of people killed in the Marange fields since the disturbances started is unclear as this is still ongoing however a conservative estimate puts the figure just over 300 (HRW, 2009). There is a well-known mass grave in Danganvura which was dug by soldiers in 2008 containing the remains of over 80 people for instance and some remains have been buried within the fields (Andersson, 2011).

Types of Mass Graves.

The liberation war, Gukurahundi, political violence, and diamond related deaths have produced different types of body deposition sites which vary from primary to secondary. Primary mass graves,

often execution sites are where individuals have been killed and buried within that location and secondary sites are where they have been transported after being killed somewhere else (Adams and Bryd, 2014; Jesse and Skinner, 2005). Mass graves within both contexts are found at schools and hospitals (St Pauls Secondary School in Lupane), at former detention centres (Butchers site Rusape, Bhalagwe Camp in Matobo), mineshafts (Hebert Mine in Mutasa, William Mine in Chibundo, Antelope Mine in Matabeleland South), caves, and former dip tanks (EAAF, 2001; Eppel, 2015). There are also individual burials at former commercial farms and within cemeteries (Dangamvura burial mentioned previously). The mineshafts are particularly problematic as there is a strong case that they have been used multiple times since the liberation war right up to present day to deposit human remains (Coltart, 2016; Chipangura, 2016).

A case in point being the William mine shaft in Mt Darwin. ZANU-PF through the Fallen Heroes Trust of Zimbabwe (FHTZ) claimed the remains belonged to those who were killed in the liberation war and dumped there. The opposition the MDC also claimed their members who have been missing and presumed dead were also buried in the same location (Fontein, 2016; Benyera, 2014). Finally, the former guerrilla movement, ZIPRA also claimed the remains belonged to their former ZIPRA cadres who were massacred at assembly points and brought to this location. This resulted in a court order granted in favour of ZIPRA, which ensued in the halt of exhumation (ZIPRA V Fallen Heroes Trust Judgment No. HB 61/11 Case No. HC 880/11). Through three case studies, this paper is going to examine the complexities around exhumation of human remains at Butcher Site, Hebert Mine and Pasiharparari all in Manicaland Province, Eastern Zimbabwe.

Methodological Conflicts in Exhumation exercises.

This section explores the fraught and intricate working relationship between the National Museums and Monuments of Zimbabwe (NMMZ) and FHTZ using three case studies of exhumation work that was undertaken at Butcher site, Hebert Mine and Pasiharparari Village in Manicaland. NMMZ is a government institution that is mandated by the (NMMZ Act 25:11) to conserve and present national

heritage in the country. It has a number of professionally trained archaeologists who mostly undertake research work that is associated with archaeological and liberation war heritage protection. The FHTZ is a mixture of former mostly ZANLA guerrillas, war veterans and, 'spirit mediums' who are involved in the search, exhumation and identification of liberation war mass graves. They are also politically aligned to the ruling ZANU-PF (Marawanyika, 2011). One of the authors of this paper was involved in all three exhumation projects working as an archaeologist with NMMZ. The contestations that will be discussed in this section hinged more on the best approach possible to use in exhuming remains of the liberation war fighters who were buried in mass graves. We will analyse this fragile working relationship from an auto-ethnography perspective that is derived from the participation of one of the author in the exhumation projects. The data that is going to be presented in this section was also obtained using the interviews, archaeological exhumations, and from material evidence analysis.

Contextual Historical Background of Butcher Site.

Butcher Site in Rusape, Zimbabwe is believed to have been used as a Rhodesian Forces (RF) secretive interrogation, torture, and execution base during the latter phase of the Second *Chimurenga* that is between 1976 and 1980. (Bunjira, 2013). Before independence the name 'Butcher' seems to have been non-existent although local residents knew that some people captured by the RF were being killed at the shooting range (Ibid). The name came into popular use during the exhumations and metaphorically Butcher was used to graphically depict and present the murder of liberation war fighters that occurred at this site (Choga, 2013). It has not yet been established when the shooting range was constructed but a map drawn by the Surveyor General's Office (SGO) in 1972 clearly shows the existence of a 300m long rifle range running in a north-north-westerly direction ending near a stream that runs westerly (SGO, 1972). An outline of the site and an analysis of remnants of old destroyed buildings seem to suggest that the site had a resident court martial. The shooting range might have been an execution area for court-martialed guerrillas, war collaborators and civilians suspected of aiding guerrillas. (Rutanhire, 2013). War Veterans interviewed stated that those who had been condemned to death were executed by a firing squad and were used as live and mobile targets (Bunjira, 2013; Rutanhire, 2013). According to this narrative by Takesure Bunjira, the mass killings at the shooting

range and the bloodletting epitomizes the suffering experienced by the liberation fighters hence the place qualifies to be called a Butcher/Slaughter Site. (Bunjira, 2013). The executed individuals were thereafter dumped in unmarked shallow mass graves scattered around the site. With time the shallow graves were exposed due to erosion and in 1993 efforts were made to rehabilitate some of the mass graves. Subsequently, in 1996 the site was designated a district heroes acre at the recommendation of the war veterans in Makoni District.

The Exhumation process.

Exhumation work at Butcher Site started as a result of a spiritual instigation by FHTZ. This being the acceptable approach in human remains investigation within the context of local cultural and political contexts. A total of nine skeletal remains of different individuals were exhumed from a twelve metres by four metres mass grave (Chipangura, 2013). The skeletal remains recovered from this trench were heavily decomposed with a number of missing body parts from the hip area to the cranium. Material remains recovered included a complete military uniforms, a shirt, three pants, and a brownish buckled belt. It is possible that these remains belonged to a male adults and the clothing recovered seem to suggest liberation fighters (Chipangura, 2013). The other remains exhumed from this trench were found wrapped in a black plastic bag. These skeletal remains were heavily fragmented and fractured with some isolated grains of hair found on what would have been the skull. Some of the materials recovered together with the remains included a pink scarf with red and white stripes, green gloves, whitish/reddish socks, eight black power bangles, a bead bracelet with greenish, royal blue, yellow, black and orange beads, and red and white glass beads from the neck area. These remains were thought to have belonged to a woman because of a floral dress and a purple jersey recovered alongside the fragmented skeletal remains. Apparent dry blood stains were also noticed on the left tibia and the general assumption here was that she was shot on the leg (Chipangura, 2013). From this analysis, it was deduced that this individual was not necessarily a liberation war fighter but might have been an ordinary person captured at a *pungwe*/ night vigil organised by the guerrilla fighters during the liberation war.

The other major exhumations were carried out by NMMZ and FHTZ was on unmarked mass grave marked number 14. This was the biggest mass grave of all at Butcher Sites and it measured a total area of twenty four square metres (Chipangura, 2013). Twenty five bodies comprising of fragmented skeletal and mostly burnt remains were recovered. The human remains were piled up and were laid in a supine position and some were in white and black plastic bags (Figure 1). The first skeletal remains were uncovered underneath the grey plastic bag at an initial depth of 89cm (Chipangura, 2013). Evidence of intense burning in this grave was also noticed from the consistent appearance of a red soil layer around all the edges of the grave. Furthermore, burnt remains of clothes and shoes recovered augmented the evidence of burning. A live round from a suspected AK 47 Riffle, a tube of margarine, woollen socks, green underwear and two medicine bottles were also discovered on the first body in this grave (Chipangura 2013). It is likely that the individual with these possessions was a medic. Two Rhodesian coins were also recovered from around what would be the hip area of the body. All the other remains exhumed from this grave exhibited signs of heavy burning which led to the conclusion that the twenty five bodies and materials from mass grave 14 were buried on the same day and were subjected to fire burning.

Insert Figure 1 Here

Figure 1; Remains exhumed from mass grave 14 at Butchers Site in white and black plastic bags (Picture by Njabulo Chipangura).

Unearthing of Human Remains at Hebert Mine.

Herbert mine commonly called Matumba Six is located at Premier farm, 21 km north west of Mutare on the foot of Chiremba Mountain, west of Old Umtali Mission School. The previous owner of Herbert Mine was Robert Truscott who was a former Rhodesian soldier (Rutanhire, 2013). The abandoned mine was later used by the RF during the latter phase of the liberation war to dump bodies in the disused mine shaft. The bodies that were dumped in the shaft were of victims tortured and killed at the

Rhodesian military base that was located just a few kilometres from Herbert mine (Devasio, 2014). Apart from dumping human bodies in the shaft, the RF also threw old accessories of vehicles, horses, wooden crates, plastics, and chemical containers, scraps of metals, plastics and rotten oranges. This was probably done to conceal the evidence of human remains. After the liberation struggle the mine was completely abandoned and become disused. (Ibid).

In 1993 Mr. Oliver Mhandu, the current owner of the Herbert mine was given a prospecting licence by the Ministry of Mines to mine at the site but only started mining operations in 2013. It was during this period that miners working for Mr. Mhandu discovered human remains, a FN rifle, AK 47 magazines rifle and several rounds of ammunition (Mhandu, 2013). The exhumation and unearthing exercise of human remains that was to follow was again carried out by NMMZ archaeologists working alongside FHTZ vernacular exhumers. The exhumation exercise at Hebert mine was undertaken between August and September 2014 and a total of 71 human remains were recovered. The estimated depth of the mine shaft was around 45 m (Chipangura, 2014). Before the exhumations at Hebert Mine by FHTZ and NMMZ skeletal bones from the mine shaft were arbitrarily removed by the mine workers previously (Manica Post, 2014). The remains of the suspected freedom fighters were removed unsystematically and bundled in a cage and hipped outside the shaft. Because of this unsystematic removal there was a comingling of human remains. It was therefore virtually impossible to reconstruct the full extent of individual human skeletons except for the bodies that were retrieved from the mine shaft in plastic body bags (Chipangura, 2014). The first body removed from the shaft by the miners was found at a depth of 32 metres. Nine bodies were exhumed from the shaft of which five human remains were in white plastic body bags. The differentiation of the skeleton bones was mutually conducted by NMMZ and FHTZ. Matching of individual skeletal remains proved to be very difficult because of the mix up of human and animal bones. Archaeologists tried to trace individual bones using the clothes that were found on some of the bodies as a separation mechanisms. Officials from the NMMZ using the minimum number approach by White (1953), concluded that there were about 41 human remains however the FHTZ insisted it was 71 without any novel scientific approach.

Massacres at Pasihaparari Village.

Oral witness narratives by villagers revealed that liberation fighters were attacked by the RF on the 8th of April 1979 at Pasihaparari Village in Mutasa District. Pasihaparari village is located 25km north of Hebert Mine. A surprise attack was launched on the liberation fighters whilst they were drinking beer at a homestead identified to be of the Maori family. (Nyagwambo, 2014). A jet fighter bombed the area and as the guerrillas were scouting for cover, helicopters dropped paratroopers who immediately launched a ground offensive on survivors (Ibid). Nine guerrillas were killed during the attack together with one civilian and were buried in two mass graves in the village. (Nyagwambo, 2014). Exhumations at Pasihaparari were again undertaken by NMMZ working with FHTZ personnel. At Pasihaparari, two trenches were set up by covering both areas that were believed to have the remains. The first trench before exhumation and subsequent expansions measured nine square metres. This trench was divided into segment A and segment B. Segment A measured about two square metres. Before the exhumations commenced, engineers from the Zimbabwe National Army (ZNA), carried out a ground checking exercise using a metal detector as earlier on narratives from interviews carried out pointed out the likelihood of stumbling across ammunition and bombs stashed within the remains. (ZNA, 2014). Thereafter the exhumations started in segment A and the first sign of material remains comprising of a threadbare blanket and some pieces of clothing were observed at a depth of 88cm (Chipangura, 2014). The systematic recovery of the bodies in segment A was led by NMMZ archaeologists working together with FHTZ exhumers. The first remains to be revealed were the left humerus, ulna, radius was recovered and bullets that were found on an assemblage which appeared to be lying on the right side. It was established the ammunition was from an AK47 rifle (ZNA, 2014). A hand grenade was also found inside this body. Most of the bones on body number one were fairly preserved. The other material remains recovered from this body include a green underwear, an orange golf t-shirt with black stripes, a brown trousers, two black power bangles and a pair of hunters shoes. From the oral interview conducted earlier - the recovered materials from body one belonged to one Cde Soweto who was the commander of this group at that time. (Choga, 2014).

The second body was also fairly preserved. Material remains that were recovered from this body include a pair of brown denim trousers and a brown denim jacket. This attire was popularly known as

the 'sting suit' during the liberation struggle. A pair hunter's shoes size 10, a yellow handkerchief with the inscription 'we sacrificed to die for our motherland Zimbabwe' and match boxes were also recovered from this body'.

The third human remains were found fairly preserved. Some threadbare pieces of a grey blanket were found covering the body. A denim black trousers, a pair of red socks with red and white designs, a white underwear with green stripes was also found in the right pocket of the denim trousers. Another prominent recovery from this body was a white pack of crescent snuff that was found in the left pocket of the denim trousers. On the other hand, recovered bones from body four constituted far less preserved, there was no complete skull and only isolated fragments were only collected. The material remains that were recovered include, a blue work- suit, a grey underwear with purple and white designs and a brown pair of stockings.

Body number five had numerous black power bangles and the individual was identified as 'Cde Sucker' based on this adornment. (Chinyane, 2014). Comrade was a moniker given to freedom fighters during the liberation war and is often shortened as Cde. His remains were found to be fairly preserved with fragmented bones constituting an average of 75% of the full body. Other material remains recovered from the body included, a tube of Colgate fluoride, a green denim trousers, a cream underwear with black dots, a brown shirt, a brown belt, a pair of tennis shoes and a white handkerchief with blue floral designs. The remains of body six were also heavily fragmented. Bone fragments from the right hand were removed first together with numerous green and white beads which were recovered from the left hand. A unique black power necklace with a rectangular design on the lower end was also recovered alongside this body. The other material remains that were found include, a black afro-comb, a tooth brush, a blue denim shirt, a brown trousers with zig- zag designs, a green pair of stockings with white line designs on the ankle, a pair of hard knock shoes (Chipangura, 2014).

The next body recovered was number seven which was heavily fragmented with little bone remains. Alongside this body a pair of green socks, a blue pen comprising of a barrel and a refill, a cream underwear with black zebra like designs, a brown denim shirt, and a white verse with a black colour were recovered. The remains of body number eight were partially fragmented and incomplete

anatomically however a white scuff, a green jacket, a green trousers, a black pair of socks, a black belt, a white underwear with yellow floral designs and a military shoe was recovered.

Body nine was also heavily fragmented and showed evidence that it was subjected to burning. Thus the few bones that were recovered were all heavily burnt. Body ten was also burnt with evidence of burning visible on the mandible of the skull and other bone remains. Material remains that were recovered alongside the body included a blue burnt overall, a white t-shirt and a blanket (Chipangura, 2014). A metal key was also recovered in one of the pockets of the overalls. The body was identified to be of Tengerai Clever Nyagwambo - a civilian who was said to have been a chief logistic officer for the liberation fighters. The identification was done by Sheila Nyagwambo, wife of the deceased due to the clothing items he wore when he went missing (Nyagwambo, 2014).

The points of friction between professional archaeologists and vernacular exhumers

Exhumations at the three sites described were undertaken through a series of contested approaches between NMMZ and FHTZ. There were huge disparity in methodological approaches implemented by both sides. Spirituality preceded all the scientific methods used by the archaeologists and it became increasingly difficult to pursue novel contemporary approaches to exhumation. Spirituality as a method of exhumation relied on deceased guerrillas who would indirectly speak with selected members of FHTZ advising them on where to exhume. The spirit of the dead would manifest on members of FHTZ who during the process would indiscriminately fall on the ground rolling over and speaking in 'tongues' – a language which was difficult to understand but was easily interpreted and translated by the other members. The possessed members who were mostly women were used by the dead as conduits to narrate how they were killed during the war and where to find their remains. Sometimes the dead would apparently speak with the living through dreams. The next morning the dreamer would direct the exhumation programme pointing out where to find remains based on clues given in the dream.

Out of this spiritually driven context, NMMZ and FHTZ had a fraught working relationship marked by negotiations and sometimes conflicts on how to conduct the exhumations of liberation war fighters. One typical conflict of interest emerged from archaeological approaches and the setting up of measured

trenches at all the sites. Systematic trenching makes it easy to document all the material culture recovered from the exhumation exercise level by level and in their proper descriptive contexts. This is usually accompanied by detailed photography of the material before any unbundling or hasty removals. However, FHTZ would exhume the human remains without following through the set up trenches and this created problems that later led to a huge mix up of the human remains in most cases. FHTZ was particularly concerned with the quick recovery of human remains because they wanted to authenticate their narrative by having a lot of bones to showcase and 'educate' the public according to Musoni (2014). The bones were displayed in makeshift mortuary tents and visitors were allowed to see the remains in view of making them appreciate the gravity of massacres at the three sites.

Moreover, the use of the archaeological tool kit also compromised the working relationship between NMMZ and FHTZ. Trowels, brushes, handpick, dust pens and sieves were used in order to meticulously recover the human remains and all fragmented skeletal remains before full documentation. However, this method was not accepted by FHTZ exhumers who were argued that the use of brushes and sieves was unethical because brushing and sieving remains is un-cultural and a sign of disrespecting the dead (Muzenda, 2014). The differences were further widened by the use of shovels, picks and spades by FHTZ exhumers. The use of such heavy working tools meant that the human remains were seriously disturbed and destroyed during the digging process. All this meant that the chances of mixing up the remains were very high.

Another issue of serious concern that made the working relationship between NMMZ and FHTZ fraught was the prohibition of the bright colours during the exhumation processes. All participants during the exhumation exercises were not supposed to put on red colour. The reason was that the colour would offset the working spirits of the exhumers and even infuriate the dead guerrillas who were being exhumed who in their operation times on the front would not also have put on a red colour (Bunjira, 2013). The colour red is associated with bad omen in local cultural nuances although in other cultures it is considered good luck (Bortoli and Maroto, 2001). Such a complication would at times result in the archaeologists putting on the red colour barred and expelled from the site. Statistics of the remains exhumed at the sites also considerably varied between the NMMZ and the FHTZ records. Sometimes

FHTZ members would improperly count the remains and at times fragmented bones of one individual would be counted as two or three people. This was a common occurrence that was encountered during the sorting exercise, but nothing would convince FHTZ members to see that they had made errors because they were concerned with getting large numbers which would be more appealing to the public.

At Butcher site the NMMZ official body count number was 111 but FHTZ had a record of 145 and at Hebert mine NMMZ official body count was 41 whereas FHTZ had 71. Ironically, coffins secured, graves dug and reburials done were all based on FHTZ statistics. In addition, FHTZ exhumers guided by spiritual methods of identification would direct archaeologists to exhume certain areas where they would be thinking that human remains could be found based on spiritual pointer we explained earlier on. This was particularly the case at Butcher Site and in all cases apart from the known marked mass graves such exhumations would yield nothing. In the end the recovery of black deep humus soil was falsely interpreted by FHTZ as evidence pointing out the existence of burnt human remains. The soils were collected and prepared for burial as burnt remains. Such an erroneous analysis would entail that the body count at the end of the exercise would be exaggerated, creating a disparity with the official count. The reason for the over estimation of human remains can be viewed within the political contexts at the time which had the trajectory of using the remains as propaganda against opposition and white farmers (Fontein, 2014).

FHTZ also used spiritual methods in identifying all the human remains during the exhumations. Archaeologists emphasized on the need of doing some DNA tests before conclusively giving out the bodies to relatives who would have come forth looking for their missing relatives. In one instance a family looking for their father who did not return from the war were made to believe that some remains recovered from Butcher site, found alongside a walking stick, belonged to their missing father. Earlier on family members had intimated to the exhumers that the disappeared and deceased used to have a walking stick (Mukangu, 2013). Family members were not able to question the authenticate FHTZ identification methods as this would have been interpreted as doubting guiding spirit from the dead. Such identification methods were quiet problematic given that remains were just dumped in mass graves and there is a possibility that the some of the accompanying material were also randomly thrown into

the graves. Thus, the positions that they occur relative to the exhumed bodies do not always necessarily entail that they belonged to the remains. The other identification method was based on the spirit of the dead emerging out from a group of FHTZ spirit transmitters who would randomly pick remains in the mass graves and give them *nom-de-guerre names*, village of origin, real names, and the time they joined the liberation struggle. At Hebert Mine and Pasihaparari for example remains of nine liberation war fighters were 'positively' identified using such 'spiritual' techniques. During the exhumation exercise, the team of archaeologists would come across a number of material cultures which include black power bangles, Rhodesian coins, medicine bottles, cigarette packs, small bags, grenades, rifles, ammunition, military uniforms, and underwear . In a quest to understand the events that transpired at these sites they wanted to collect such materials but there was always resistance from FHTZ members who argued that such a practice would anger the dead.

Conclusion

In conclusion, the use archaeological approaches in the exhumation and identification of human remains by NMMZ working with FHTZ was problematic and deeply contested due to the dissonant nature of exhumation methods. FHTZ used spirituality derived from communicating and connecting with the dead through trance and in dreams. In their perspective, all subsequent exhumations were sanctioned by the dead through the spiritual realm. As a result, proper archaeological methods such as test trenching and auger surveys were disregarded by FHTZ. In addition, there were other anthropological approaches such as sex assessment, ancestry, and isotype analyses that could have been carried out to ensure that novel identification is conducted. FHTZ wielded too much power in the process and in most cases the spiritual methods did not yield correct results and this resulted in a heavy mix up of human remains, incorrect body counts and false burials. However, FHTZ is politically aligned to the ruling ZANU-PF. possess no relevant training, and the use of spirit mediums in identification of human remains has no scientific basis. It is hoped that in future, training can be provided to FHTZ, as it stands, the exhumation and identification methods will further obscure witness testimony, truth telling, or future judicial undertakings.

Bibliography.

Adams, B. & Byrd, J. 2014. *Commingled human remains: methods in recovery, analysis, and identification* Academic Press: Oxford.

Alao, A. 2012. *Mugabe and the Politics of Security in Zimbabwe* London: McGill-Queen University Press.

Alexander, J., McGregor, J. & Ranger, and T. 2000. *Violence and Memory: One Hundred Years in the 'Dark Forests' of Matabeleland*, James Currey: Oxford.

Alternative Information Development Centre. 2016. *Blood Diamonds 8 years after the Marange Massacre* [Online] Available from <http://aidc.org.za/blood-diamonds-eight-years-marange-massacre/>. [Accessed 03/08/2017].

Alexander, J; McGregor, J & Ranger, T .2000. *Violence and Memory: One Hundred Years in the 'Dark Forests' of Matabeleland*. Harare: Weaver Press.

Andersson, H .2011. Soldiers tell of Zimbabwe diamond field massacre *BBC* 8 August 2011. [Online] Available from http://www.bbc.co.uk/panorama/hi/front_page/newsid_9556000/9556242.stm [Accessed 31 January 2019].

Berkeley, B. and Schrage, E .1986.. *Zimbabwe, Wages of War*. New York: Lawyers Committee for Human Rights.

Bhebhe, N. and T. Ranger. .1996. Soldiers in Zimbabwe's Liberation War, Volume One. *Journal of Southern African Studies* 22 (4): 671-671.

Bortoli, M and Maroto, J. 2001. *Colours Across Cultures: Translating Colours in Interactive Marketing Communications*. Proceedings of the European Languages and the Implementation of Communication and Information Technologies (Elicit) conference: University of Paisley

Bunjira, T .2013a. *Butchers Site Exhumation*. 12 February 2013.

Bunjira, T .2013b. *Butchers Site Exhumation* .28 April 2013.

Burgis, T. 2015. *The Looting Machine: Warlords, Oligarchs, Corporations, Smugglers, and the Theft of Africa's Wealth* London: Harper Collins

Cameron, H. 2017. The Matabeleland Massacres: Britain's wilful blindness, *The International History Review*, [Online]. Available at DOI: 10.1080/07075332.2017.1309561. [Accessed 30/05/2017]

Chidza, R. 2015. Zanu PF recruits 80 000 Green Bombers *NewsDay* 30 December 2015 [Online] <https://www.newsday.co.zw/2015/12/30/zanu-pf-recruits-80-000-green-bombers/>. [Accessed 12/01/2019].

Chipangura, N. 2013. *Butcher Site Exhumation Report*. Unpublished, National Museums and Monuments of Zimbabwe

Chipangura, N. 2014. *Hebert Mine and Pasihaparari Exhumations Report*. Unpublished: National Museums and Monuments of Zimbabwe

Chipangura, N. 2017. The Illegal Diamond Mining Exhibition: A Vehicle for Museum Renewal and Effecting Social Change, *Exhibition* 36 (2):37-45.

Chipangura, N. and Marufu, H. 2019. Museums as public forums for 21st century societies: a perspective of the National Museums and Monuments of Zimbabwe. In: *Museums Activism*, Janes, R and Sandell, R (Eds), London: Routledge. 164-173.

Chitukutuku, E. 2017. Rebuilding the liberation war base: materiality and landscape of violence in Northern Zimbabwe, *Journal of Eastern African Studies* 11 (1) 133-150

Choga, G .2013. *Butchers Site Exhumation* 24 April 2013.

CCJP (Catholic Commission for Justice and Peace) & LRF (Legal Resources Foundation) .1997. *Breaking the Silence, Building True Peace: A Report on the Disturbances in Matabeleland and the Midlands, 1980-1989*. Harare: CCJP & LRF.

Chitiyo, K. and M. Rupiya, (2005) Tracking Zimbabwe's political history: the Zimbabwe Defence Force from 1980-2005. In: M. Rupiya, (Ed). *Evolutions and revolutions: a contemporary history of militaries in Southern Africa*. Pretoria: Institute for Security Studies, 331-363.

Chooma, B .2018. Re-Living the Chibondo Genocide Africa Blogging [Online] Available from <https://www.africablogging.org/re-living-the-chibondo-genocide/>. [Accessed 31 January 2019]

Chung, F. .2006. *Re-living the second Chimurenga: memories from the liberation struggle in Zimbabwe*. Uppsala: Nordic Africa Institute.

Coltart, D. .2017. *The Struggle Continues, 50 years of Tyranny in Zimbabwe* South Africa. Jacana Media.

Courville, C.2012. Intelligence Ethics, The African Authoritarian State Security Apparatus *International Journal of Intelligence Ethics*.3 (2) 1-17

Doran, S. (2017) *Kingdom, power, glory Stuart Doran Mugabe, Zanu and the quest for supremacy 1960–1987* Midrand: Sithatha Media.

Cross, E.2016. The Tragedy of the Disappeared [Online]. Available from <http://www.eddiecross.africanherd.com/> [Accessed 15/01/17].

EAAF. Country Report. *Zimbabwe*. .1999- 2001. [Online] Available from http://eaaf.typepad.com/cr_zimbabwe/. [Accessed 15/01/2019].

Eppel, S. .2015. The heroic and the hidden dead, Zimbabwe and Exhumations In: Groen, W. J.M, Marques-Grant, N, and Janaway, R.C. (Eds) *Forensic Archaeology, A Global Perspective*' Chichester: Wiley and Sons. 359-366

Evans, M.2007. The Wretched of the Empire: Politics, Ideology and Counterinsurgency in Rhodesia, 1965-80. *Small Wars & Insurgencies*. 18 (2) 175-195.

Fontein, J. .2016. Remaking the Dead In; Stepputat, F. (Ed). *Governing the dead: sovereignty and the politics of dead bodies*. Manchester: Manchester University Press.114-140

Jessee, E. & Skinner, M. 2005. A typology of mass grave and mass grave-related sites", *Forensic Science International*, 152 (1). 55-59.

Kruger, Norma J. .2003. *Guerrilla Veterans in Post-War Zimbabwe: Symbolic and Violent Politics, 1980-1987*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Magaisa, A. 2016. The Big Saturday Read: Presidential Amnesty – A short history of impunity and political violence in Zimbabwe [Online] <https://www.bigsr.co.uk/single-post/2016/04/22/The-Big-Saturday-Read-Presidential-Amnesty-A-short-history-of-impunity-and-political-violence-in-Zimbabwe>. [Accessed 12/01/2019].

Mandikwaza, E. 2016. The Place for Amnesty in Zimbabwe's Transitional Justice Process. *African Centre For the Constructive Resolution of Disputes*. 16 (2)

Marawanyika, G. .2011. Politics clouds mass grave in Zimbabwe *Mail and Guardian* 20 April 2011 [Online]. Available from <https://mg.co.za/article/2011-04-07-politics-clouds-mass-grave-in-zimbabwe> [Accessed 15/02/2019]

Mhanda, W. 2011. *Dzino: memories of a freedom fighter*. Harare: Weaver Press.

Mhandu, O.2014. Herbert Mine Exhumation 18 September 2014. Mutare.

Mukangu, W. 2013. *Butchers Site Exhumation* 01 May 2013. Mutare

Musoni, X .2013. *Butchers Site Exhumation* 24 April 2013.

Mutambara, A. 2014. *The Rebel In Me: a ZANLA Guerrilla Commander in the Rhodesian Bush War, 1974-1980*. Havertown: Helion & Company.

Muzenda, P. 2013. *Butchers Site Exhumation* 23 April 2013.

Nyagwambo, S. 2014. *Pasihaparari Exhumation*. 7 October 2014. Mutasa.

O'Brien, K. A.2011. *The South African Intelligence Services: From Apartheid to Democracy, 1948-2005*. London: Routledge.

Partnership Africa Canada PAC. 2012. *Reap What You Sow: Greed and Corruption in Zimbabwe's Marange Diamond Fields* Ontario: PAC.

Phimister, I. 2008. The Making and Meanings of the Massacres in Matabeleland: Revisiting the Heart of Darkness *Development Dialogue* 50 (1) 197–214.

Reeler, T. 2009. *Subliminal terror?: Human rights violations and torture in Zimbabwe during 2008*. Johannesburg: Centre for the Study of Violence and Reconciliation.

Rukuni, C. 2009. Zimbabwe VP Implicated in Blood Diamond Scandal *Huffington Post* [Online] 25 May 2011. Available from https://www.huffingtonpost.com/groundreport/zimbabwe-vp-implicated-in_b_166766.html. [Accessed 21 January 2019].

Rutanhire, F. 2013. *Butchers Site Exhumation* 21 April 2013.

Shaw, W. H. 1986. Towards the One-Party State in Zimbabwe: a Study in African Political Thought. *The Journal of Modern African Studies*. 24 (3) 373.

Sibanda, E. M. 2005. *The Zimbabwe African People's Union, 1961-87: a political history of insurgency in Southern Rhodesia*. Trenton: NJ: Africa World Press.

Silika, K. 2019. *Forensic Archaeological Interdisciplinary Approach to clandestine Burials found in Zimbabwe*. Forthcoming. Unpublished PhD Thesis. Staffordshire: Staffordshire University.

Simpson, J. G. 2018. *Monitoring Marange: human rights surveillance, the Kimberley process, and Zimbabwe's blood diamonds*. Thesis submitted in fulfilment of a Doctor of Philosophy Degree in International Development. Oxford: University of Oxford,

Sachikonye, L. 2011. *When a State Turns on its Citizens: 60 years of Institutionalised Violence in Zimbabwe*, Harare: Weaver Press.

Saunders, R., & Nyamunda, T. 2016. *Facets of power: politics, profits and people in the making of Zimbabwe's blood diamonds*. Harare: Weaver Press.

Savage, T. & Chimhini, B.S. 2003. Zimbabwe, A Hundred Years War In: Doxtader,& Villa-Vicencio (Eds) *Through fire with water: the roots of division and the potential for reconciliation in Africa*. Claremont: David Phillip Publishers. 187-220

Scarnecchia. 2008. *The Urban Roots of Democracy and Political Violence in Zimbabwe: Harare and Highfields* Rochester: University of Rochester Press.

Sithole, M. 1999. *Zimbabwe: struggles-within-the-struggle (1957-1980)*. Harare: Rujeko Publishers.

Surveyor General Office .1972. *Mutare*. Harare: Department of the Surveyor-General

Tafa, M. 2013. The Trajectory of Iniquitous Dictatorship in Zimbabwe In: Nyamanga, M and Nasong'o, W. S (Eds) *Regime Change and Succession Politics in Africa: Five Decades of Misrule* London: Routledge. 80-97.

White, T, E. 1953. A method of calculating the dietary percentage of various food animals utilized by aboriginal peoples *Am. Antiq.*, 18 (4) 396-398.

Zimbabwe Human Rights Forum NGO .2019. *An Updated Report on the Human Rights Violations Committed between 14 January, 2019 and 5 February, 2019* ZHRF: Harare

Zimbabwe National Army Officer. 2014. *Pasihaparari Exhumation*. 12 April 2014.